

Students' FLA and Their Perspectives on Translanguaging Practices in Indonesian EFL Classrooms

**Mas'ud Madhani Sanjaya
Joko Nurkamto
Sumardi**

Universitas Sebelas Maret,
Indonesia

masudmadhani@student.uns.ac.id

ABSTRACT

In non-English speaking countries, some teachers found it difficult to teach the target language in monolingualism because some of the learners felt anxious about learning English as a foreign language, or called foreign language anxiety (FLA), so teachers implemented translanguaging in their EFL classes. This paper explores students' perspectives on pedagogical translanguaging and the point of view on whether the use of translanguaging is beneficial in the English foreign language (EFL) classroom and how translanguaging helps EFL learners through their FLA. The participants of this research are four students in a junior private Islamic school in Indonesia. The methodology of this research is qualitative, while the type of research used is a case study and analysis with thematic analysis. The findings of this paper are that students get more benefits when the teacher uses translanguaging in their class because it helps them understand the learning objectives, the teacher's instructions, and gives them the confidence to follow the English language learning without fear of misinterpretation. Translanguaging can manage and negotiate students' FLA in the EFL classroom.

Keywords: Foreign language anxiety, translanguaging, translanguaging pedagogy, EFL

INTRODUCTION

There is a strong tradition of teaching second and foreign languages in isolation even when programs aim at the development of bilingual or multilingual competence, moreover when teaching English in an English foreign learner (EFL) classroom. As students who learned English as foreign learners, they have negative experiences and tension in the EFL classroom. When the teacher speaks fully English in the classroom, it can be intimidating for EFL learners as they experience the negative emotional reactions of Foreign Language Anxiety (FLA).

Emotional aspects such as Foreign Language Anxiety have been the subject of much discussion in recent decades. Learning English in a foreign language country is not easy. Somehow, learners of English foreign language (EFL) have emotional reactions to FLA. This effective factor, in particular, is thought to be a major impediment to target language learning and production) (Horwitz, 2001). Horwitz et al. (1986) defined FLA as "a distinct complex construct of self-perceptions, beliefs, feelings, and behaviors related to classroom language learning arising from the uniqueness of the language learning process" for future research. Some researchers highlight the distinctive feature of FLA as a situation-specific type of anxiety associated with second language (L2) learning contexts. Many studies have found a significant negative correlation between FLA and L2. Foreign language classroom situations, according to researchers, are especially anxiety-inducing due to their interactive nature (Yang, 2012). In fact, while FLA has been linked to various language skills, oral production is regarded as the most stressful aspect of the L2 classroom, owing to students' fears of communicating. Moreover, MacIntyre (1999: 27) described FLA as the "worry and negative emotional reaction aroused when learning or using a second language". This emotional state may interfere with the production of the new language by causing anxiety, nervousness, worry, and tension.

FLA's severe nature can cause additional emotional effects that can potentially ruin L2 users' emotional well-being in a variety of ways, including feelings of embarrassment and self-shame, and loss of self-confidence and self-esteem (Dovchin, 2020, 2021). When speaking English, L2 users frequently feel tongue-tied, self-conscious, restricted, and diminished (Hinds et al., 2014), and they have a low self-perception of their linguistic, academic, and professional abilities. As a result, L2 can have a negative impact on the social, personal, academic, and professional performance of L2 speakers in a variety of

settings. Horwitz et al., (1986) designed the Foreign Language Classroom Anxiety Scale (FLCAS) to measure the level of anxiety of Foreign language learners while learning the target language in the context of the classroom. The FLCAS has been extensively used in language anxiety studies across different disciplines due to its high reliability and validity. The scale deals with general foreign language anxiety although it especially highlights speaking and listening skills. According to Horwitz (1986), FLA is linked to three types of anxiety: communication apprehension, test anxiety, and fear of negative evaluation. Fear of communicating with people or in front of others is referred to as communication apprehension. Some learners appear to experience anxiety, frustration, and self-consciousness as a result of their lack of proficiency in foreign languages. The fear of failing in tests is referred to as test anxiety. Test-anxious students are frequently evaluated and are often afraid of making mistakes. Finally, fear of negative evaluation is related to learners' concerns about negative judgments or evaluations from others.

Undoubtedly, translanguaging has emerged as a highly favored instructional method in today's applied English as a Foreign Language (EFL) classrooms, amidst the current emphasis on multilingualism and plurilingualism. The credibility of this approach is supported by numerous instances of individuals who adeptly and intentionally switch between different languages, linguistic styles, and communication patterns to enhance their understanding and facilitate effective communication. Although theories advocating for multilingualism and plurilingualism have been accessible for quite some time, and there have been repeated calls to reshape language teaching practices (Conteh & Meier, 2014). Furthermore, translanguaging safe spaces for the students. Within these environments, individuals are afforded the opportunity to engage in challenging and potentially uneasy dialogues in a manner that fosters a supportive atmosphere. These spaces serve as a haven where participants can alleviate stress and feelings of isolation, while also establishing meaningful connections with others who have experienced similar situations (Harpalani, 2017).

In the realm of multilingual proficiency, the practice of translanguaging predominantly manifests itself in learners' receptive and productive language skills (Garcia, 2014). The prevalence of monolingual English-only communication in English language learning classrooms, whether in an English as a Foreign Language (EFL) context or otherwise, has become so pervasive that teachers often experience guilt if they permit their students to utilize their native language (L1) during instruction, as noted by Cook and Moore

(2014). Garcia (2019) defines translanguaging as the discourse strategies employed by bilingual individuals, as well as pedagogical approaches that leverage the complete linguistic repertoire of bilingual students to teach both rigorous academic content and language skills.

Pedagogical translanguaging involves tapping into the linguistic resources of multilingual speakers, as their prior knowledge can enhance comprehension and promote language and content development (Escamilla et al., 2013; Flores & Garcia, 2013; Lin, 2016). A study conducted by Jasone and Durk (2020) explores pedagogical translanguaging and reveals a recognition of the value of linguistic resources, positioning learners not as deficient English users, but as multilingual speakers. In the research conducted by Jenifer and Caryl (2018), teachers' perspectives on the utilization of students' first languages in the classroom are investigated, revealing varied acceptance and resistance towards supporting and encouraging the use of students' native languages. Additionally, other studies highlight the necessity of implementing and emphasizing translanguaging in multilingual EFL classrooms (Paweł Sobkowiak, 2022). Building upon the aforementioned research, implementing translanguaging in the classroom can leverage learners' linguistic repertoires and foster a supportive learning environment to enhance comprehension of the target language.

Many specialists have given their own definitions of translanguaging. Translanguaging is defined as "the process of producing meaning, changing experiences, gaining insight, and knowing by combining two languages." (Baker, 2011) The first language (L1) and target languages are referred to as the second language (L2). Translanguaging, according to Baker and Wright (2017), "may promote a deeper and fuller understanding of the subject matter." Given that a) prior knowledge serves as a foundation for further learning and b) cross-linguistic transfer is simple because two languages are interdependent (Cummins, 2017), translanguaging "builds understanding in the most efficient way." Several ideas about the potential benefits of translanguaging are linked to new approaches in multilingual education.

Pedagogical translanguaging makes use of the multilingual speaker's entire linguistic repertoire, as prior knowledge can aid comprehension and language and content development. In a translanguaging EFL classroom, an English-only, monolingual classroom in a translanguaging EFL classroom." In a translanguaged EFL classroom, the monolingual approach is abandoned, and learners are perceived as resourceful agents with multilingual repertoires,

abilities, and talents rather than as deficient, non-native English speakers defined by what they lack (Garcia & Kleifgen, 2018). They are encouraged to use all of their linguistic resources and dexterity in order to preserve their cultures and identities while expanding their repertoire by learning English features. "Teachers should know when to allow their students to draw on their linguistic repertoire and when to redirect their attention to the TL," write Aghai, Sayer, and Vercellotti (2020 p. 357,).

Some EFL students' claimed translanguaging as their safe spaces, as a general term, is related to either a physical location or a social gathering that allows marginalized groups to meet and discuss social and cultural issues that others outside of that group do not understand (Harpalani, 2017). In this context, safe spaces that encourage the full use of their members' linguistic diversity can subvert English-only monolingualism, empower their participants to engage in greater cultural and linguistic access and expression (Back et al., 2020), and facilitate the resolution of language difficulties (Li, 2018). Translanguaging spaces also facilitate migrant EFL learners' more comfortable negotiation of meaning and identity, allowing them to share their understanding of being different on cultural, linguistic, ethnic, and/or racial grounds (Ollerhead, 2019). As translanguaging spaces encourage empathy, inclusiveness, positive emotions, and linguistic and cultural expression, it is a space where they can share their migrant EFL learner identities and talk freely without feeling judged, stereotyped, or evaluated (Fang & Liu, 2020). Translanguaging safe spaces promote trust among interactants and have a significant therapeutic benefit for EFL students. For EFL learners' who face FLA-like forgetfulness, showing avoidance when communicating English, frustration, and self-consciousness as a result of their lack of proficiency in foreign languages. Then when their teacher applied translanguaging in the EFL classroom they could accept the materials from their teacher by translanguaging.

The present study focuses on a research paper that offers practical insights into translanguaging within the context of multilingualism. Among the various terms used, "translanguaging" has emerged as the most commonly used term, or as Pennycook (2020) suggests, "the preferred term." This term refers to the process of creating meaning, shaping experiences, and acquiring understanding and knowledge by utilizing two languages in a given context. Previous scholars have explored translanguaging practices in the study of the Chinese language within higher education. One such study conducted by Danping Wang (2022) investigates learners' perspectives on the use of both their first and second languages in

foreign language classrooms at the tertiary level. The findings of this research uncover a discrepancy between the prescribed monolingual approach and the perceived reality of translanguaging. Students expressed a desire to maintain a translanguaging space as a scaffolding and stress-relieving strategy in fast-paced learning environments. They felt that the use of translanguaging facilitated two-way communication, aligning with the emphasis on intellectual dialogic pedagogy in higher education.

The next previous study is about translanguaging as an emotional safe space for foreign language learners in Australia by S. Dryden et al (2021) this research investigate how four migrant adult EFL learners in Australia the finding of this research show the importance of safe education and emotional spaces for migrant background EFL learners, where such spaces can allow EFL learners to authentically share their lived experiences, problems, and emotional expressions through translanguaging, which can assist in the alleviation of the negative emotional reactions of FLA. Ahn, S-Y et al (2018) have done research investigating the effect of translanguaging practices on learners' willingness to communicate and foreign language anxiety in the Korean EFL context. This research explored how Korean EFL undergraduates demonstrate their level of WTC and FLA in the implementation of translanguaging. The result of this research suggests the potential of translanguaging as a pedagogical practice and process in fostering learners' willingness to communicate in the EFL context.

This research explores students' FLA experiences in the English classroom and their perspective when the teacher implemented translanguaging into bilingual or multilingual. Students' perspective is the point of view whether the use of translanguaging is beneficial in the EFL classroom or not is still unexplored and wants to be addressed in this proposed study. Therefore, there are research questions conducted from this study:

1. How do students perceive the translanguaging practice in their Indonesian EFL classrooms?
2. How does translanguaging help EFL learners through their FLA?

METHOD

This research takes place in a junior private Islamic school in Indonesia and was conducted in an English foreign classroom. The

data for this research were derived from four students in a junior private Islamic school as the participants with pseudonyms Nesyia, Naya, Arka, and Ari who were interviewed based on their perspective and experience in the EFL classroom with translanguaging.

The methodology of this research is qualitative, while the type of research used is a case study. Case study research scientifically investigates into a real-life phenomenon in depth and within its environmental context. Such a case can be an individual, a group, an organization, an event, a problem, or an anomaly (Burawoy 2009; Stake 2005; Yin 2014). The common case study research data can be collected by observation, interview, and test or questionnaire. Merriam (1988) calls it a multi-case study where participants have similar importance in demonstrating the phenomenon under study. Unstructured interviews were debated with four participants of research to know and describe their perspective in translanguaging in EFL class at different times. In a case study, interviewing is necessary when we are interested in past events that are impossible to replicate (Merriam 1988). In addition, this was used to provide the interviewee with broad freedom of expression and elaboration and often resemble informal talks (Seliger & Shohamy 1989). A thematic analysis of the data was suitable for this research. Thematic analysis also represents the intellectual and ethical challenge, for experienced and novice researchers alike, of attempting to reveal and interpret themes and subthemes in the participants' discourse.

Braun & Clarke (2006) provide a six-phase guide which is a very useful framework for conducting this kind of analysis. 1.) become familiar with the data resource, 2.) generate initial codes, 3.) search for themes, 4.) review themes, 5.) define themes, 6.) write up. The procedures in this study's data analysis began with the collection of raw data. Following the data collection, the researcher performed thematic coding by highlighting data that was relevant to the topic and categorizing it using theoretical coding or linking it to a theoretical concept to search and review themes in the data and define the appropriate theme. After coding the data then the researcher interprets it with a reflective coding matrix that features the idea of a data interview and write up the result.

FINDINGS AND DISCUSSION

1. Perspectives about English Only or Multilingual EFL Classrooms

Based on the interviews with the four students in an EFL classroom all of the students agree that translanguaging is really needed in their class because it helps the students understand the instruction of their teacher, the question and know what they should do in the classroom. The first participant said Nesya,

“Yes, if everything is in English, I don't understand everything the teacher says, if the teacher uses English in Indonesia, I understand what that means and what should I do in the class”.

The students stated the positive effects of learning through translation after the EFL classroom. The translanguaging process in the classroom really helps students understand lessons for those who lack English vocabulary. Carrares (2006) studies' results confirm that translation into L2 is consistently regarded by students as a very effective language learning activity. It would seem that they will like translation as a pleasurable activity. It is possible that they also stimulate their own conscious learning in understanding the logic in a target language, as a sign of their interest in discovering new structures in their own learning.

Furthermore, students have difficulty following the lesson if the teacher later uses full English because they are still confused to understand word for word. If the teacher later uses full English in class, students will have difficulty understanding the instructions from the teacher and will be unable to complete the assignments given by the teacher. Naya Stated,

“The students will not understand if it is spoken entirely in English. Later, when the teacher speaks in full English, then I'm doing the wrong task because I don't know what it means, but if it's interpreted first, I'll be fine”.

In addition, the third participant, Arka stated,

“Translanguaging in class makes the learning process helpful and easier for us. I feel pity for my friends who won't understand what you're talking about, right?”

It is related with the result study of Lewis (2009) about learners' perception of their experience in translanguaging classroom which concluded that inclusion of the L1 can reduce student anxiety in the EFL classroom and enhances the effective environment for learning. The use of full English in a class where children who still lack

vocab and are not confident when speaking English will hinder the learning process in the target language, whereas the use of translanguaging will increase children's desire to learn and prevent them from feeling pressured during EFL class.

2. Foreign Language Anxiety and Translanguaging

In this interview, several students also mentioned FLA in the EFL classroom. They described feelings like communication anxiety, test anxiety, and self-consciousness as a result of their limited language skills. Nesya and Naya said in the interview that

"If the teacher doesn't translate instructions into English, I am unable to understand what instructions are being given. Consequently, I struggle to answer the questions correctly since they are not interpreted beforehand."

The second participant, Naya also stated

"I'm afraid if I answer the wrong questions and get a bad score because I don't understand English"

Test anxiety pertains to the apprehension or fear of failure when facing tests. Students who experience test anxiety often perceive themselves as constantly being evaluated and have a fear of making mistakes. This fear of test outcomes not meeting their expectations arises from their struggles in mastering English, which subsequently hinders their ability to effectively answer test questions (Horwitz & Young, 1991). Another aspect of FLA also mentioned by another participant in the interview, it indicated self-consciousness of their lack of proficiency in foreign languages, Arka stated

"The disadvantage is that I can't speak English as a result, I am limited in speaking and can't communicate fluently"

The lack of proficiency in the L2 can lead to anxiety, frustration, and self-consciousness in some learners. The learner is aware that his lack of proficiency in L2 causes the learner to be unable to reach the target language in communication apprehension. According to FLA and learners' assessments of their speaking and listening abilities in English, participants' anxiety levels appear to rise as their perceived language proficiency levels in both areas decline (Koul et al., 2009; Liu, 2006).

3. Examples of Translanguaging Practices in The EFL Classrooms

Two of the four participants Nesyia and Arka described the same activity, professional material in which students who come forward in front of the class have to guess the picture in English and other friends give a clue of one word in English, which other friends interpret and practice the gesture of the profession in the picture. The third participant Arka stated,

“Profession ma'am, guess the picture isn't it? I was asked to answer in English, then my friends who were sitting in the front told me to give a clue in English and interpreted it, and then gave the gesture, how does it work. Then Ari is holding the picture behind me, he brought the paper, so I guessed what profession is on that paper”

Translanguaging, according to Garcia and Wei (2014), differs from code-switching in that it refers to the speakers' creation and use of original and complex interconnected discursive practices that cannot be easily assigned to one or more traditional definitions of a language, but that comprise the speakers' entire semiotic repertoire. The gesture is a common element of the semiotic repertoire. The gesture is an activity with distinct temporal, spatial, and social properties that participants not only recognize but actively use in the organization of their interaction (Goodwin, 1986/2009, p. 47).

Ari gave an example of a class activity in which the teacher translated the reading sentences in the descriptive text that was explained so that students understood what the teacher was saying.

“Descriptive text because when it is translated every sentence makes it easier for me to know. For example, I will read the English language, so later on, Bu Uud will tell me the Indonesian language, usually like that. So you know what this story was”

Other research proven by Husain's (1995) research, using translation had a highly positive effect on low and intermediate-proficiency learners, but it had no effect on higher-level students. The researcher discovered that using a translation strategy could improve English learning in general.

Other participants shared the same opinion on various materials. Naya provided an example of narrative text where students

were asked to read the narrative text in English with storytelling then the teacher would interpret the story in a language that is easy for students to understand, students who like the material will understand the purpose of the material presented by the teacher more easily. So that when they role-play, they can remember keywords and imitate the dialogue from the narrative text.

"When it was a narrative text, ma'am, I was asked to stand in front of the class and play the role of Grandma. I didn't understand what the text said at first, but Bu Uud interpreted it and explained what it meant so I could impersonate and imitate Grandma."

It is also stated by Hsieh (2000) in his findings research, Taiwanese students believed that translation improved their reading comprehension and vocabulary learning. In terms of learning new vocabulary words, students believed that translation learning was more effective than context learning.

4. Perspectives about The Practice of Translanguaging and Help Them as a Safe Space

All participants prefer it when the teacher teaches in multilingual by translating it because it aids in the process of learning English. This is because translanguaging provides more benefits for them, allowing students to be more confident when working because they follow instructions and achieve learning objectives. Translanguaging environments can help by giving participants deeper channels for expression (Kim & Park, 2019). It temporarily reduces FLA-related emotional reactions like fear, distress, and embarrassment is possible in translanguaging spaces. Although there is a disadvantage if the teacher does not use monolingual English in the EFL class, the students will feel less fluent and limited in speaking English, but this is acceptable as long as the students understand the meaning and meaning of using translanguaging. Arka in the interview stated

"Yes, it's easier, and I understand better. If it's a disadvantage it'll be limited and the speaking will be slurred. Yes, I want to speak fluently as well, but I disagree that I won't be able to do so later in full English. So it's better for me if I comprehend first."

Some participants suggested continuing the translanguaging activities that were already in place in class, such as guessing pictures and translating text, while others suggested that students give presentations in front of the class first, followed by group discussions. Before speaking in front of the class, the students must translate and arrange the words they will be speaking. So, they are not afraid to speak in front of the class for fear of saying something incorrectly. It was stated by Arka

"I think the presentation will be interesting. But, before we begin our presentation in front of the class, we should have a group discussion. After the group discussion, If I don't know what it means or instruction I will ask first, then my friends and I will arrange the text first, followed by the presentation in English."

Translanguaging can support EFL learners' practice of the English language by lowering anxiety while also helping them build their linguistic confidence and analyze their FLA instances. Additionally, translanguaging safe spaces can encourage EFL students to speak openly about their experiences with sympathetic interlocutors, giving them the chance to gain confidence through assistance from one another and the sharing of varied experiences as well as practice in an EFL classroom.

CONCLUSION

This study concludes that the implementation of translanguaging in the English as a Foreign Language (EFL) classroom, as perceived by students and based on their experience of foreign language acquisition (FLA), brings numerous benefits. When teachers utilize translanguaging, students find it easier to comprehend the learning objectives and instructions, which instills confidence in their ability to navigate English language learning without the fear of misinterpretation. They express a desire for teachers to continue using translation as they acknowledge that English is not their native language and they lack the vocabulary necessary for understanding monolingual English conversations. By incorporating translanguaging practices, EFL learners are better equipped to overcome challenges related to interaction and context-based FLA. This allows them to engage in translanguaging as a means of negotiating their emotions during the learning process.

REFERENCES

- Back, M., Han, M., & Weng, S. C. A. (2020). Emotional scaffolding for emergent multilingual learners through translanguaging: Case stories. *Language and Education*, 34(5), 387–406. <https://doi.org/10.1080/09500782.2020.1744638>
- Baker, C., & Wright, W. E. (2017). Foundations of bilingual education and bilingualism (6th ed.). Bristol, UK: Multilingual Matters.
- Barahona, M. (2020). The potential of translanguaging as a core teaching practice in an EFL context. *System*, 95, 102368. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.system.2020.102368>
- Braun, V. & Clarke, V. (2006). Using thematic analysis in psychology. *Qualitative Research in Psychology*, 3, 77-101.
- Canadian Journal of Applied Linguistics, 10, 221e240.
- Cummins, J. (2017). Teaching for transfer in multilingual schools. In O. Garcia, A. Lin, & S. May (Eds.), *Bilingual and multilingual education, encyclopedia of language and education* (3rd ed., vol. 5). Springer.
- Cenoz, J. (2017). Translanguaging in school context. International perspectives: An introduction. *Journal of Language, Identity and Education*, 16, 193e198.
- Cenoz, J., & Gorter, D. (2020). Pedagogical translanguaging: An introduction. *System*, 92, 102269. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.system.2020.102269>
- Cummins, J. (2007). Rethinking monolingual instructional strategies in multilingual classrooms.
- Dovchin, S. (2020). The psychological damages of linguistic racism and international students in Australia. *International Journal of Bilingual Education and Bilingualism*, 23(7), 804–818. <https://doi.org/10.1080/13670050.2020.1759504>
- Dovchin, S. (2021). Translanguaging, emotionality, and English as a second language immigrants: Mongolian background women in Australia. *TESOL Quarterly*. <https://doi.org/10.1002/tesq.3015>
- Escamilla, K., Hopewell, S., Butvilofsky, S., Sparrow, W., Soltero-Gonzalez, L., Ruiz-Figueroa, O., et al. (2013). *Biliteracy from the start: Literacy squared in action*. Philadelphia, PA: Caslon.
- Fang, F., & Liu, Y. (2020). “Using all English is not always meaningful”: Stakeholders’ perspectives on the use of and attitudes towards translanguaging at a Chinese university. *Lingua*, 247, 1–18. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.lingua.2020.102959>
- García, O., & Li, W. (2014). *Translanguaging: Language, bilingualism and education*. New York, NY: Palgrave Macmillan.

- Goodwin, C. (1986/2009). Gestures as a resource for the organization of mutual orientation. *Semiotica*, 62(1-2), 29-49.
- Harpalani, V. (2017). "Safe spaces" and the educational benefits of diversity. *Duke Journal of Constitutional Law and Public Policy*, 13(1), 117-166.
- Hinds, P. J., Neeley, T. B., & Cramton, C. D. (2014). Language as a lightning rod: Power contests, emotion regulation, and subgroup dynamics in global teams. *Journal of International Business Studies*, 45(5), 536-561.
<https://doi.org/10.1057/jibs.2013.62>
- Hsieh, L. T. (2000). The effects of translation on English vocabulary and reading learning. In *Ninth International Symposium on English Teaching, Taipei, Taiwan, ROC*.
- Holdway, J., & Hitchcock, C. H. (2018). Exploring ideological becoming in professional development for teachers of multilingual learners: Perspectives on translanguaging in the classroom. *Teaching and Teacher Education*, 75, 60-70.
<https://doi.org/10.1016/j.tate.2018.05.015>
- Horwitz, E. K. (1986). Preliminary evidence for the reliability and validity of a foreign language anxiety scale. *Tesol Quarterly*, 20(3), 559-562.
- Horwitz, E. (2001). Language anxiety and achievement. *Annual review of applied linguistics*, 21, 112-126.
- Husain, K. (1995) 'Assessing the Role of Translation as a Learning Strategy in ESL', *International Journal of Translation* 1.2: 59-84.
- Jones, B. (2017). Translanguaging in Bilingual Schools in Wales. *Journal of Language, Identity & Education*, 16(4), 199-215.
<https://doi.org/10.1080/15348458.2017.1328282>
- Li, W. (2018). Translanguaging as a practical theory of language. *Applied Linguistics*, 39(1), 9-30.
<https://doi.org/10.1093/applin/amx039>
- MacIntyre, P. D., & Gardner, R. C. (1994). The subtle effects of language anxiety on cognitive processing in the second language. *Language Learning*, 44(2), 283-305.
<https://doi.org/10.1111/j.1467-1770.1994.tb01103.x>
- Ollerhead, S. (2019). Teaching across semiotic modes with multilingual learners: Translanguaging in an Australian classroom. *Language and Education*, 33(2), 106-122.
<https://doi.org/10.1080/09500782.2018.1516780>
- Pennycook, A. (2020). The future of Englishes: One, many or none?. In *The Routledge handbook of world Englishes* (pp. 679-692). Routledge.

- Seligar, H. W., & Shohamy, E. (1989). *Second language research method*. New York: Oxford University Press.
- Sobkowiak, P. (2022). Translanguaging practices in the EFL classroom - the Polish context. *Linguistics and Education*, 69, 101020. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.linged.2022.101020>