

Quality Analysis of English Subtitles in Indonesian YouTube Video using Appraisal Theory

Efrain Aero, Safrina Noorman
Universitas Pendidikan Indonesia
Efraimaer.edu@gmail.com

ABSTRACT

This research aims to assess the quality of English subtitle in several video blogs (vlogs) made by Indonesian YouTube content creators. Subtitle can be described as words that translate what the speaker is saying in a video into a different language and subtitle usually appear at the bottom of the screen. Subtitle holds important roles in digital era. Subtitle helps content creator to convey contents of their vlogs. Subtitle also able to help viewer who are deaf or having difficulties with hearing so they can enjoy the vlog. Subtitle also able to help content creator reach out to global audience. Indonesian content creator usually provides English subtitle on their vlog to aim global YouTube viewer. Subtitling is not an easy process. Subtitling involves a shift from oral to written. Subtitling involves linguistics aspect and is the reason such research exists. Linguistic aspect such as appraisal theory is needed to assess the quality of subtitle. This research aims to identify quality of English subtitle which contains appraisal system. The data of this research were taken from vlogs and it were collected through library research. This research classified as descriptive qualitative research. The result of this study shows that some Indonesian content creator still need some quality improvement of its subtitle.

Keywords: Translation, Appraisal, Subtitle

INTRODUCTION

The presence of social media like Facebook, Instagram, and YouTube has open up new opportunities in translation study. Social media is quite different than traditional media such as television and newspaper. Manny (2014) describes social media as term often used to refer new form of media that involve interactive participation. Oxford Dictionary 10th Edition define social media as websites and software program use for social networking. Meanwhile Carr and Hayes (2015) describe social media as internet based

distrained, and persistent channels of mass personal communication facilitating perceptions of interactions among user, deriving value primarily from user-generated content. Desjardin (2017) states that one of difference between traditional media and social media is that traditional media functioned according to a top-down model. Traditional media does not give the audience to participate as much as it does with social media. Social media give people benefit of freedom. Social media allow user to have freedom to share disseminated and processed information to public area.

Social media do have limitation. Desjardin (2017) states one of limitation of social media is that social has limitation on inability to communicate in an unknown language. It means that people who speak different language has limitation on sharing information on social media platform. Social media user who speaks or write something in Korean will have language barrier to people who does not speak same language. Litau (2015) point out the role of social media in shaping thoughts and words of its user. Social media has become source of information for public and therefore the information supposed to be understood globally. Litau's statement is the proof of correlation between social media and translation study. Translation could help with language barrier so the message whom one user tries to convey can be understood by wider audience.

Social media has become an essential in modern society. Everyday people share something on social media. Desjardin (2017) describe this habit on sharing something on social media have relation to human nature. She states human has the need to socialize and to share information or knowledge. Butow (2020) believes that human has need to have connection with others. Humans have a deep-rotted desire to be part of communities where they are accepted and have opportunities to contribute. Social media able to provide human desire. Nowadays human able to contribute to share information and knowledge through social media. Desjardin (2017) state that in present day people who has access to electronic device and internet can contributed to share information and knowledge.

Nowadays people have lot of platforms to share their thoughts. One of them is YouTube. YouTube is believed as one of the best social media to share information in video form. Butow (2020) believe one of the reasons Youtube became populer was because YouTube was created simply as a way for people to share videos with other people. In the early 2000 other social media networks did not support video playback. YouTube considered as unique social media and pioneer in term of video sharing. Kane (2020) defines YouTube as video sharing site that allows users of the site to upload and watch videos online. YouTube was officially launched in 2005. The launch of the YouTube site was well received worldwide. People were excited and it were proven by the high participation of the site users. Sahlin (2007) stated that in 2005 users of the YouTube site uploaded about seven

million videos per day. Kane (2020) stated that the popularity of the YouTube site was predicted from the first day it was launched. In its first month, the Youtube was visited by three million visitors and that number tripled in the third month. YouTube has managed to establish itself as one of the top ten websites in the world. Kane (2020) also states that YouTube considered as one of the fastest growing websites in human history.

In 2007 YouTube introduced the YPP (YouTube Partner Program) or YouTube partner program. Kopf (2020) states that YPP allows YouTube content creators to monetize their YouTube channels. Puggioni (2020) states that monetization is the act of making something profitable. The benefits obtained through YPP are in the form of money earned through advertisements inserted in videos uploaded by YouTube users. Setyawan (2016) said that YPP helps content creator to be able to place advertisements. YPP works on a pay per view system – meaning that the content creator will earn money from every video that watched by YouTube visitor. Setyawan (2016) explains that advertisements on YouTube are divided into three categories, non-skippable in stream ads (ads that cannot be skipped), true view stream ads (skippable ads) and overlay in-video ads (small ads located at the bottom of the video). The more ads watched by YouTube visitors, the more income for content creators. Profits through these ads will be accumulated in the uploader's YouTube account and can be withdrawn when the amount reaches certain number.

YPP changes the purpose of YouTube. YouTube were originally aim entertainment purpose are now starting to be aim to economic profit. Schepp (2009) stated that YouTube is not only a platform used for entertainment. This site can also be used to make money. People who make video (content) as a profession are called content creators. Agung (2019) states that uploading videos to the YouTube is no longer a plain hobby, but it has become a serious profession. Some people make a career into YouTube and the main purpose is to gain money from uploading video to YouTube. Those who make a career from YouTube usually called as content creator. Agung (2019) defines a content creator as a person or institution who creates creative video content and uploads the video to YouTube. Butow (2020) states that it is true that most of content creator intended to monetize their platform in some way be it though display ads or something else, but Bustow believe that their initial goal was to help people connect in some new and unique way. In conclusion Bustow state that money is not the only reason content creator make YouTube video. Content creators are also responsible for the development of the YouTube channel. Content creators are expected to attract a large audience so that they can reap profits through advertising. Eves (2021) states that the growth of a YouTube channel depends on the content creator's understanding of the channel's audience statistics. Content creators are expected to be able to resonate with their audience, so that content creators understand the wishes of their audience.

Content creator are expected to be able to gain strong fanbase so their fan could come back and watch more video. Content creator need to be creative so they can develop their channel and gain lot of viewers.

The development of a YouTube channel can be done in various ways such as *go global*. Go global is a term that use by people to describe the effort of marketing YouTube video to another country. Content creator might able to gain new viewer while trying to aim global audience, for example Indonesian content creator might try to aim Malaysian audience. Eves (2021) states that the development of cross-country YouTube channels is possible because YouTube is a site that is not limited by geographic boundaries. Murphy (2020) states that YouTube allows video uploaders to share their uploaded videos globally. Clyne (2019) states that going global is the right strategy to increase YouTube channel visitors. Clyne also states that going global is not always easy. Language barriers may arise if the targeted audience does not speak the same language as the content creator. Desjardin (2017) suggested content creator to provide subtitle in different language, so people who does not speak the same language as the content creator can understand the content of the video. Content creator could ask a translator to translate the video content and make it available to new audiences, sometimes in support of certain ideological or political agendas or sometimes only to share content that would appeal to a fanbase. It might sound easy but translating one language to another language has its own challenges. The translation needs to be aware and able to find out whether the translation is the most appropriate or even the most desirable in a global audience. The translator needs to know that the key of social media translation is how the creator able to communicate to its user follower audience.

Translation for YouTube can be done in two ways, there are dubbing and subtitling. Dubbing is an act of fabricating audio to make viewer believes that the character on screen speak share the same language as the viewer. This type of translation is less popular because dubbing is more difficult than subtitling. Subtitling according to Cintas (2021) is defined as a translation practice that consist in presenting a written text, generally on lower part of the screen, that aims to recount the original dialogue exchanged among the various speakers as well as all other verbal information that is transmitted visually.

One of Indonesian content creator who provide subtitle on their YouTube channel is Rafa Dhafina. She is Indonesian influencer who own a channel called Rafa Dhafina. Rafa's channel owns around four hundred thousand subscribers. Rafa provided English subtitle which translated by subtitler name Nina. Providing English subtitle is considered as a wise move since English is the most used language in YouTube followed by Hindi and Portuguese. As state in previous paragraph, language problem will arise

when the content creator tries to aim global audience. Murphy (2020) states that language problems will arise when content creators market their videos to other countries. Murphy believe that this obstacle can be overcome by adding a subtitle to videos which uploaded by content creators. Hidayatullah (2017) also believe that translated subtitle texts that appear below the screen might benefit content creator. Agung (2019) states that translated subtitle texts that able to help viewers to understand the content of dialogue in a video. In conclusion it can be said that subtitles considered as an important instrument to suport content creators who want to market their video globally. Calabrese (2020) states that the availability of captions helps content creators to reach more viewers.

The previous paragraph shows how important subtitle is for aiming global audience. Hidayatullah (2017) states that the translation of subtitles must be done with a high sense of responsibility. Subtitle is a tool that connects content creators with viewers who doesn't share same language. Subtitler is expected to be able to translate the video content and make it understandable for global audience. Therefore, this research aims to assess the quality of English subtitle on Indonesian YouTube channels. This research use Appraisal theory provided by Martin and White to evaluate the quality of English subtitle on Indonesian YouTube channel. This research is expected to be able to improve the quality of English subtitles on Indonesian YouTube channels.

METHOD

Research method is systematic framework of structure which used to guide research. This methodology usually consists of data source, method and technique of collecting data and technique of analyzing data. Translation study is classified as part of applied linguistic research. Cook (2003) defines applied linguistic as the academic discipline concern with the relation of knowledge about language to decision making in the real world. Data for this research were taken from Indonesian YouTube vlog titled "Let's talk - Having a Boyfriend, How to Be Productive QnA ", "College Final Exams Vlog", "What I Eat In A Day". Those three vlogs were taken from Rafa Dhafina's YouTube channel.

This research was classified as qualitative research. Qualitative research according to Alwasilah (2005) is research whose findings are not obtained through statistical or quantification procedures. Data for this research were collected by using the note-taking method. Researchers collected subtitle from several YouTube video and analyze data with appraisal theory provided by Martin and White. Appraisal according to Wiratno (2018) is a theory related to the exploration of attitudes that are negotiated in the text. There are three simultaneous assessment systems,

namely attitude, graduation and engagement. Martin and White (2005) state appraisal framework focus on linguistic resources for by which text come to express, negotiate and naturalize particular inter-subjective and ultimately ideological positions. Appraisal framework concern on how linguistic mechanism share emotions. This research only focusses on one aspect of appraisal namely attitude. Attitude involves around emotion, ethics and aesthetic. Attitude then divided into three categories namely affect, judgement, and appreciation.

FINDINGS AND DISCUSSION

Data for this research were taken from several video blog from Rafa's Channel. This research only focusses on one aspect of appraisal framework namely *attitude*. Attitude can be described as ways of feeling. As stated above, attitude is divided into three categories there are affect, judgement, and appreciation.

Affect

Affect is concern with registering positive and negative feeling. Do the content creators feel happy or sad, confident or anxious, interested or bore, etc.

NO.	SOURCE LANGUANGE	TARGET LANGUANGE	ATTITUDE
1.	<i>Aku agak sedikit malu gitu kan, engga pd (percaya diri)</i>	I was a bit shy, lost my confident.	Affect
2.	<i>Aku merasa tidak nyaman.</i>	I felt a bit uncomfortable	Affect
3.	Aku menjadi malu.	I.. somehow get embarrassed	Affect

The subtitler done quite well translating source language into target language. There are two affections found in data 1, **shy** and **lost my confidence**. The subtitler make a little mistake when translating phrase *engga pd* into lost my confidence. Subtitler should translate that phrase into not confidence, or insecure. Subtitler also make small mistake when translating data 2 and data 3. Subtitler add information that were not available on source language. Subtitler did not need to add phrase *little bit* on data 2, and word *somehow* on data 3. As state in previous section, social media translation focus on how the creator able to communicate to its user follower. The subtitler fulfill that purpose, the audience able to understand that there were some actions that make content creator feel shy, uncomfortable and embarrassed. The words *malu, tidak nyaman, dan*

menjadi malu are classified as negative affection in source language and the subtitle keep the affect in target language. The translation from data 1-3 considered as acceptable translation, it was good but still not equivalent.

Judgement

Judgement dealing with attitude towards behavior, which speaker or writer admire or criticize, praise or condemn.

NO	SIURCE LANGUAGE	TARGET LANGUAGE	ATTITUDE
4.	Kok engga pake tutup yang bulet itu?	Why they aren't using the round lid cover?	Judgement
5.	Ternyata enak walaupun engga biasa.	Taste good! This is not a common.	Judgement
6.	Loh kok tiba-tiba jadi kaya bisa masak gitu sih?	How come you good at cooking all of sudden?	Judgment

Translation from data 4,5,6 is quite clear. Data 6 may not sound like a judgement but if we look closer, we will understand that the utterance is a part of compliment. The speaker praises her sister for her ability to cook. It seems that the cook ability increasing and the speaker was shock by it.

Appreciation

Appreciation dealing with the way people appreciate things, react to certain things and give those things value.

NO	SOURCE LANGUAGE	TARGET LANGUAGE	ATTITUDE
7.	<i>Ini juga teksturnya ringan.</i>	The texture are so light.	Appreciation
8.	<i>Sumpah ini kulitnya mulus banget.</i>	It's so smooth.	Appreciation

The subtler make mistake in translating data 7. Subtler suppose to write also, the texture is light. The speaker trying to react to a product by saying that the product (lotion) has light texture and can be easily absord by the body. Data 8 lost some context; the word skin is missing in target language.

CONCLUSION

Based on the discussion above, this research proves that in the context of appraisal framework, subtitle in Rafa's able to translate emotion to its audience. Rafa provide good quality English subtitle. She needs to improve certain aspect of the subtitle so people able to understand the message she tries to convey to her audience. English subtitle also proven work raising viewer number and add several global audiences.

REFERENCES

- Agung, G. (2018). *Kitab youtuber*. Elex Media Komputindo.
- Butow, E. (2020). *Ultimated guide to social media marketing*. Entrepreneur Media, Inc.
- Cintas, J.D. (2021). *Subtitling concepts and practices*. Routledge.
- Clyne, G. (2019). *Social media marketing mastery*. Charlie Piper Publishing.
- Desjardin, R. 2017. *Study in translating and interpreting; translation and social media*. Macmillan Publisher.
- Eves, D. (2021). *The youtube formula*. Wiley.
- Hidayatullah, S. (2017). *Seluk beluk penerjemahan Arab Indonesia*. Grasindo.
- Kane, A. (2020). *Social media marketing and online bussiness*. Amazon Digital Service LLC.
- Kopf, S. (2020). *Rewarding good creators corporate social media discourse on monetization schemes for content creators*. Sage Publications.
- Litau K. (2015). Translations and materialistis of communication. *Translation Studies*, 9(1), 82-96
- Murphy, R. (2020). *Youtube channels* (2nd Ed.). Wiley
- Puggioni, V. (2020). *How to monetize*. Oberlo.